

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 10084151 9

CASES AND MATERIALS ON FAMILY LAW

**EDITED BY
BERNARD GREEN**

SEPTEMBER 1978

VOLUME I

The materials produced herein are
intended for the sole use of law
students at McGill and Toronto.


CASES AND MATERIALS ON FAMILY LAW

EDITED BY

BERNARD GREEN

SEPTEMBER 1978

VOLUME I



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

- 1 -

TABLE OF CONTENTS

GENERAL

	<u>Page</u>
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	2
I The Constitutional Framework	2
II The Legislative Framework	2
III The Institutional Framework	2
A. The Courts	2
B. Other Agencies	2
C. The Lawyer	2
IV Some Views on Marriage	13
 CHAPTER TWO: FORMATION OF THE FAMILY UNIT AND ANNULMENT	 30
I Introduction	30
II The Constitutional Issue	31
III The Statutory Conditions	35
A. License and Formalities	35
B. Effect of Failure to Comply with Statutory Conditions	38
C. Age and Parental Consent	45
IV The Conditions Imposed By The Common Law	49
A. Introduction	49
B. A Man and a Woman	49
C. ... Who are Free to Marry	57
D. ... Who Consent to Marry Each Other	59
E. ... And Who Are Able to Consummate the Marriage ...	85
V Defences To A Nullity Action	97
A. Knowledge	97
B. Conduct	102
C. Delay and Improper Motive	110
D. The Effect of Petitioner's Own Impotence	115
VI The Nullity Decree	119
A. Jurisdiction And Other Matters	119
B. Conflicts Problems	120
C. Economic Consequences	120
D. Children	120

	<u>Page</u>
VII Reform: The English Approach	121
CHAPTER THREE: DIVORCE	129
I Grounds	129
A. General	129
B. Immediate Relief: The Fault Grounds	131
C. Delayed Relief: Marital Breakdown	199
D. Proposals For Reform	244
II Bars and Defences	249
A. The Possibility of Reconciliation	249
B. Absolute Bars Applicable To All Grounds	255
C. Discretionary Bars	266
D. Special Bars Applicable Only To s. 4 Grounds	312
E. The Problem Of Insanity	317
III Nature And Consequences Of Divorce	319
A. Jurisdiction	319
B. Recognition	324
C. Consequences	330
CHAPTER FOUR: ECONOMIC RELATIONS BETWEEN "SPOUSES"	332
I Introduction	332
II Ownership Of Property	333
A. Introduction	333
B. The Law Prior to the F.L.R. Act	349
C. The F.L.R. Act	386
III Mutual Duty of Maintenance	410
A. While Married	410
B. On Dissolution of Marriage	422
C. Special Problems: Contracting Out, Welfare and Problems of Federalism	485
CHAPTER FIVE: CHILDREN	502
I Introduction	502
II Proving And Disproving Parenthood	504
III Custody	510
A. Private Disputes	510
B. Disputes Involving The State Or A Coercive Agency..	635
C. Custody And Guardianship After Death Of Natural Guardian	690

		Page
IV	Access	692
V	Adoption	698
	A. The Statutory Scheme	698
	B. Consent Of Natural Parents	705
	C. The Religious Factor	716
	D. Access	721
VI	The Parent-Child Relationship	723
	A. Parental Control	723
	B. Economic Relations	728
CHAPTER SIX: PROTECTION OF THE FAMILY UNIT AGAINST INTER- FERENCE BY THIRD PARTIES		754
I	Between Husband And Wife	754
	A. Intentional Interference	754
II	Between Parent And Child	770
APPENDIX OF STATUTES		

	<u>Page</u>
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	2
I The Constitutional Framework	2
II The Legislative Framework	2
III The Institutional Framework	2
A. The courts	2
B. Other agencies	2
C. The lawyer	2
Reisman, Beyond the Call of Obvious Duty	3
Freeman and Freeman, Lawyers Cannot Avoid Counselling	6
IV Some Views on Marriage	13
Rudikoff, Marriage and Household	13
Sage, Dissolution of the Family under Swedish Law	21
Ryan, Maintenance Obligations in a New Legal Concept of Marriage	26
CHAPTER TWO: FORMATION OF THE FAMILY UNIT AND ANNULMENT	30
I Introduction	30
II The Constitutional Issue	31
Kerr	31
III The Statutory Conditions	35
A. License and formalities	35
The Marriage Act, 1977	35
B. Effect of failure to comply with statutory conditions ..	38
The Marriage Act, 1977	38
Friend, "Common Law Marriage in Ontario"	38
Alspector	42
Friend, "Common Law Marriage in Ontario"	43
C. Age and parental consent	45
The Marriage Act, 1977	45
Re Fox	47
IV The Conditions Imposed By The Common Law	49
A. Introduction	49
B. A man and a woman	49
Baker v. Nelson	49
North v. Matheson	51
M.T. v. J.T.	54
C. ... Who are free to marry	57
Re Perry	57
The Marriage Act, 1977	58

	<u>Page</u>
D. ... who consent to marry each other ...	59
(1) Mental capacity	59
The Marriage Act, 1977	59
Chertkow v. Feinstein	60
Whitaker v. McNeilly	67
(2) Mistake as to the nature of the ceremony	70
Nane v. Sykiotis	70
(3) Mental reservations	73
Gardner	73
(4) Duress	75
Thompson	75
(5) Fraud	80
Moss	80
H. v. C.	83
E. ... and who are able to consummate the marriage	85
(1) What constitutes consummation	85
Baxter	85
Wilkinson	88
(2) Inability to consummate	90
(a) Physical	90
Foster	90
(b) "Invincible repugnance"	92
Heil	92
Greenlees	94
Foisy	95
V Defences To A Nullity Action	97
A. Knowledge	97
G. v. G.	97
B. v. B.	101
B. Conduct	102
R.E.L.	102
W. v. W.	107
C. Delay and improper motive	110
Clifford	110
J. v. J.	114
D. The effect of petitioner's own impotence	115
Pettit	115
VI The Nullity Decree	119
A. Jurisdiction and other matters	119
The Annulment of Marriages Act	119
Rose	119

	<u>Page</u>
B. Conflicts problems	120
C. Economic consequences	120
D. Children	120
VII Reform: The English Approach	121
Gretney, "The Nullity of Marriage Act 1971"	121
CHAPTER THREE: DIVORCE	129
I Grounds	129
A. General	129
Green, "The Divorce Act of 1968"	129
Divorce Act	130
B. Immediate relief: the fault grounds	131
(1) Adultery	131
(a) What it is	131
Orford	131
Dennis	133
(b) Proving adultery	134
(i) Standard of proof	134
Smith	134
(ii) Methods	134
1. Physical condition	134
M. v. M.	134
Preston-Jones	136
Himmelman	138
2. Circumstances	140
Downie	140
Little	143
3. Admissions	147
Divorce Act	147
The Evidence Act	147
Ewasiuk	148
Veysey	149
Rosen, "The Privilege Against Self-Incrimination as to Adultery - Should It Be Abolished?"	150
Rayner	152
Hunter	152
4. Other decrees	153
Love	153
Meshwa	155
(2) Other sexual misconduct	157
Divorce Act	157
G. v. G.	158
M. v. M.	160
T. v. T. and W.	161

	<u>Page</u>
(3) Cruelty	163
Divorce Act	164
(a) Relevance of the common law alimony standard ...	164
N. v. N.	164
(b) Grave and weighty conduct	169
Knoll	169
Feldman	169
Wittstock	171
Shumila	175
Hattie	178
(c) The relevance of intention	179
Gollins	179
Anderson	193
(d) Mutual cruelty	196
Kelly	196
(e) The time problem	198
C. Delayed relief: marital breakdown	199
Divorce Act	199
(1) "Separate and apart"	201
J.B. v. A.W.B.	201
Deslippe	205
Boechler	206
Dorchester	208
Lachman	209
(2) Desertion	213
(a) Without just cause	213
Nutley	213
Sullivan	215
Struk	218
G. v. G.	219
Bird	222
Marsden	224
Slon	226
(b) "...and with the intention to remain apart permanently ..."	228
Lilley	228
Kaczmarz	232
(c) the problem of mutual desertion	235
Price	235
(d) termination of desertion	238
Digiacinto	238
Richards	239
March	241
Gushta	242

	<u>Page</u>
D. Proposals for reform	244
Goldstein & Gitter, On Abolition of Grounds for Divorce	244
II Bars and Defences	249
A. The possibility of reconciliation	249
Divorce Act	249
Irving & Irving, Conciliation Counselling In Divorce Litigation	250
B. Absolute bars applicable to all grounds	255
(1) Collusion	255
Divorce Act	255
Sopinka, "The Divorce Act 1968, Collusion Confined"..	256
(2) Fraud	263
Fromovitz	263
C. Discretionary bars	266
(1) Connivance	266
Divorce Act	266
Berger	267
(a) Consent	268
Rumbelow	268
T. v. T.	270
(b) Passive acquiescence: investigation	272
Pearl	272
Hechter	273
(c) Termination of connivance	278
Godfrey	278
(2) Condonation	280
(a) Introduction	280
Divorce Act	281
(b) The common law	282
(i) Knowledge, forgiveness and re-instatement..	282
Leaderhouse	282
Douglas	287
Bateman v. Bateman	288
Vance	289
Henderson	294
(c) The effect of the Divorce Act	297
Divorce Act	297
Cherinski	297
Boivert v. Marineau	298
Armstrong	301
Blackburn	303
Brown	304
Blue	308

	<u>Page</u>
(3) The exercise of discretion	309
Divorce Act	309
Blunt	310
D. Special bars applicable only to s. 4 grounds	312
Divorce Act	312
Raggett	313
Savage	315
E. The problem of insanity	317
B. v. B.	317
III Nature and Consequences of Divorce	319
A. Jurisdiction	319
Divorce Act	319
Mendes da Costa, Some Comments on the Conflict of Laws Provisions of the Divorce Act, 1968	320
B. Recognition	324
Divorce Act	324
Mendes da Costa, Some Comments on the Conflict of Laws Provisions of the Divorce Act, 1968	324
C. Consequences	330
(1) Status	330
Divorce Act	330
(2) Economic: see Chapter Four	331
(3) Children: see Chapter Five	331
CHAPTER FOUR: ECONOMIC RELATIONS BETWEEN "SPOUSES"	332
I. Introduction	332
II Ownership of Property	333
A. Introduction	333
Friedman, A Comparative Analysis	333
Law Reform Commission of Canada	339
B. The Law Prior to the F.L.R. Act	349
Gissing	349
Murdoch	359
Rathwell	368
Becker v. Pettkus	378
Marvin	382
C. The F.L.R. Act	386
(1) Provisions applicable to determining ownership of all types of assets	386

	<u>Page</u>
(2) Provisions concerning family assets	388
(a) What is a family asset	388
(b) Powers of court in relation to family assets and other types of property	390
(3) Provisions relating to the matrimonial home	392
(a) What is the matrimonial home	392
(b) Consequences of finding that property is a matrimonial home	393
Silverstein	395

